

Lesson Procedures: Truman's Loyalty Program

Framing Question: Do Cold War fears during the Truman Administration justify the institution of the government Employee Loyalty Program in a democratic society?

Note- This module is organized around four basic steps essential to an inquiry. You are welcome, and encouraged, to tailor these steps to the needs of your students. Younger students might need additional direction and collaboration is provided here.

Step 1: Framing the inquiry

1. Students should restate the inquiry question in their own words, establishing exactly what it is asking. Students might work with a neighbor to predict what possible perspectives might be available on the question.
2. An essential component to discussion of this topic is the historical context. Ideally, this lesson would follow discussion of the end of World War II (including Yalta and Potsdam), rebuilding Europe via the Marshall Plan, the policy of containment in both Europe and Asia. Although many of the sources in this lesson predate the Korean War, it might be helpful to do this lesson as an investigation of the "Cold War at home," so the lesson likely could follow an examination of containment in Asia. Regardless of where the lesson falls in the scope and sequence of the course, it is important that students understand the larger context. In addition to the framing question, students should generate a list of questions that they need to know regarding Cold War politics and foreign policy in order to proceed. These questions should include background knowledge they anticipate needing or related questions that they find interesting. Students will use these questions to help guide how they examine the sources and what additional resources they might request.

Examples of questions for this lesson might include:

- *Why was Truman committed to containment?
- *Why did Truman find it necessary to establish the Loyalty Program?
- *Why was Truman uneasy about the Loyalty Program?
- *How did the public react to the Loyalty Program?
- *How did foreign policy developments between 1945 and 1950 shape Cold War fears at home?
- *In what ways does the Loyalty Program reflect the Cold War fears at home?
- *How did the Loyalty Program impact government workers?
- *How is the Loyalty Program, which was practiced in the Executive Branch of the federal government, relate to the rise of Senator Joseph McCarthy in the Legislative Branch?
- *What is the legacy of the Employee Loyalty Program?
- *How might the Loyalty Program relate to current issues?

3. Discuss the above questions as possible historical context points. Students should keep in mind the overall tenor of the Cold War as they examine the documents and the essential question. Perhaps have students create a short timeline of some of the foreign

policy developments from 1945-1950 so they can place the documents in context of those other issues.

4. The background essay focuses primarily on the Loyalty Program as it relates to the larger context. Teachers may wish to present this essay (and other sources if desired) to give students context for the inquiry. Consider the following strategies to make this effective:
 - a. The students or teacher might read the essay aloud, establishing the main point of the reading.
 - b. The teacher may choose to lecture the material in the background essay or assign it to be read individually.
 - c. Revisit the question. How does this information change or expand our understanding of what the question is asking? How does it affect our initial understanding?
 - d. Student should re-read the essay individually, looking for information that might provide answers or clues to their original questions. Students might be asked to record their questions and answers in a class notebook.
 - e. Other activities might involve:
 - i. Opening up the document- research topics that are new or confusing.
 - ii. Using context to infer meaning of new words/phrases
 - iii. Compare the essay to other sources (textbook, articles) on the same topic.
 - f. Create a graphic organizer that might help organize evidence collected from the sources. Students may wish to add information from the essay to the foreign policy timeline.

Step 2: Go to the sources

Note- each source should be looked at separately for information that will help reveal perspectives on the question. Consider the following steps with each source, understanding that students will need less assistance as they repeat the process.

1. All sources have a story. They were produced by a person at a time and place in history. The instructor should model how to analyze these circumstances in order to predict their influence on the content of the source. These include:
 - a. Examining the creator, predicting what this person might create based on who they are.
 - b. Considering the intended audience of the source, predicting how the content might be influenced its format and purpose.
 - c. Brainstorm the context of the source, paying particular attention to the events, attitudes, and forces at work at that time and place.
2. Use all of this information to predict the reliability and utility of the source. History students should recognize that all sources are worth investigating even if they represent a viewpoint not recognized by themselves or other sources.
3. Students should view sources like a detective looks at a crime scene. Each source should add information towards the questions established in step 1. To support student success consider the following steps:

- a. Students look over the source to get a general idea of the content.
- b. Determine whether or not predictions were accurate.
- c. Ask questions, researching or working with other students to clarify confusion.
- d. Examine the format of the source. If necessary, model the kinds of questions to ask or details to pay attention to that are specific to that format.
- e. Categorize the source based on its perspective. Which possible answer does this source support?
- f. NOTE: discussion questions are provided following each source.

Step 3: Reviewing the evidence

Note- By reviewing sources, students should have gathered many ideas that are relevant to the question. This step allows learners to look at this evidence and decide what it actually reveals. What is the best interpretation based on the evidence?

1. Go back to Step 1 and review the possible interpretations of the answer predicted by the class. How many of those panned out? What additional interpretations were exposed through the rest of the learning?
2. In groups, students should use evidence collected to identify multiple or competing interpretations to the question.
3. Direct students to complete the graphic organizer, "Weighing the Evidence," which asks students to categorize the documents as their perspectives illustrate opposing viewpoints on the Loyalty Program. Students should categorize the documents with key pieces of evidence from the documents that support the categorization. They should not just write "Source 1," etc. on the graphic organizer, but should include key details from the document.
4. Small group discussion of the evidence:
 - a. After students have categorized the documents, consider facilitating small-group discussions of their categorization. Students should discuss why they categorized a document as they did on their graphic organizers, using specific details from the documents to support their categorization.
 - b. Following discussion of categorization, students may begin to grapple with the essential question in their groups. What does the evidence show in terms of a response to the framing question?
5. Socratic Seminar: Pose the framing question as a class discussion prompt. As a facilitator, teacher may wish to remind students of importance of context to this discussion. Remind students that the transition from World War II to Cold War was so quick that Truman and his advisors were acting quickly on many decisions. How does that shape student opinion on the framing question?

*Possible extension: Lead into McCarthyism to explore how the Legislative branch responded to some of the same Cold War fears. Many Republicans in Congress felt Truman's Loyalty program was not enough to meet the threat of communism at home. Refer students to specific documents that might illustrate this, and discuss how McCarthyism and HUAC grew during the same period.

***Possible extension:** How relevant is this discussion in our current world? (Perhaps bring up Summer 2016 story: “Hensch, Mark. “Gingrich: Revive House Un-American Activities Committee,” The Hill, June 14, 2016, 07:16 pm.)
URL: <http://thehill.com/blogs/ballot-box/283511-gingrich-revive-house-un-american-activities-committee>

Step 4: Communicating an answer

Note- By communicating an answer to the framing question students are accomplishing several thinking tasks at once. The teacher does not have to assess everything a student does but should be aware of the importance to model and/or provide quality examples so that this format doesn't get in the way of students sharing what they have learned from the documents. If you have been working specific types of writing or speaking, consider working this step around those goals.

1. Provided in the materials for this lesson is a resource entitled *Answering the Question*. In determining the product of learning for this lesson consider the following criteria.
 - a. What is the skill level of my students?
 - b. What literacy goals can I support with this product?
 - c. Does the format of the product allow students to communicate a claim and use evidence from the sources to support it?
 - d. Can students have a say in what they produce to show their learning?
 - e. Do all students need to have the same product?
2. Construct a rubric for the product, careful to assess student proficiency towards your class learning goals. A sample rubric is provided following this step.
3. Provide students time to create their initial product in class allowing collaboration as needed. Consider having students get feedback from peers at multiple points in this process. When soliciting feedback from a peer a student should first identify what he/she would like help with, then be prepared to ask for help and input.
4. Before collecting student work, consider having students self-assess their work using the rubric. This is an important step that will help them take more ownership in their ultimate grade.

	0	1- Below Basic	2- Basic	3- Proficient	4- Advanced
P= Your main idea	Is not able to demonstrate any part of this task.	Can create a claim only with guidance from the instructor.	Creates an appropriate claim on a topic but is not able to introduce or give further explanation to the idea.	Clearly introduces and stakes out a position on the topic.	Clearly introduces the range of possible answers on a topic while staking out a clear position that can be supported with evidence.
E= Evidence you have to support your main idea.	Is not able to demonstrate any part of this task.	Includes generalizations or other ideas not aligned to the prompt	Generally alludes to evidence but does not cite it, or draws from only one account;	Refers to relevant and accurate evidence from more than one source and links it directly to specific accounts, mentioning the accounts by name.	Seamlessly integrates evidence from multiple sources by accurately summarizing details and using source information to establish its relevance.
E= Evaluation and Explanation of your evidence	Is not able to demonstrate any part of this task.	Distinguishes or sorts between evidence that is/ is not relevant to answering a question or explaining a point of view.	With minor errors explains how evidence is relevant to the question or point of view of the paragraph.	Accurately explains the significance of the evidence used to answer the question.	Accurately explains the significance of evidence used and evaluates the reliability or utility of the available sources.
L= Link to context/content	Is not able to demonstrate any part of this task.	Provides a conclusion that is confused or is not relevant to the evidence.	Provides a general conclusion sentence that summarizes the main point of with no specific link to the point.	Links the back to the original point by summarizing how the evidence supports the main idea.	Links back to the original point by both placing the evidence within historical context and by summarizing how the evidence supports the main idea.

Answering the Question



Truman Presidential
Museum & Library

Because document-based activities begin with a question, the most natural way to assess students' learning is to have them answer the question. Typically this involves structuring and organizing evidence in order to complete a formal essay writing. While the informational essay is certainly an important skill in a social studies classroom there are also many other valid ways to have students create well-reasoned explanations based on available evidence. Consider the following options for students to answer the guiding question.



1. Allow students to use the [RAFT format](#), guiding them to select some or all of the following variables for student writing: Role, Audience, Format, Topic. Examples:
 - a. Role: Truman, Audience: Press, Format: Speech/Press Release, Topic: Justifying Loyalty Program (an excerpt from one of Truman's speeches defending the program is provided in supplemental documents)
 - b. Role: Reporter, Audience: American readers, Format: News story, Topic: Truman announced loyalty program
2. Direct students to write an argumentative essay based on the guiding question.
3. Ask students to evaluate the documents provided in the activity, ranking the usefulness of each in answering the guiding question.
4. For AP students: Use the documents to answer the following DBQ in preparation for the AP Exam: Analyze the factors that led to creation of Truman's Loyalty Program. (contextualization/causation)